Effect of Learning And Growth Perspective (LGP) in Performance Appraisal using Balanced Scorecard of Objective (BSCO) As An Alternative To Staff Performance Appraisal and Development (SPADEV) Reporting System in the Civil Service of Lagos State, Nigeria

Gift Chinatu Okorie, PhD

Abstract

Evaluation of performance from the Learning and Growth Perspective (LGP) is not only the engine of organizational growth but the bedrock of institutional Research and Development (R&D). The LGP is responsible for repositioning employees into valuable resources for attaining organizational vision, departmental key performance indicators (KPIs) and individual key performance deliverables (KPDs). The disregard for LGP in performance appraisal mechanisms contributed to the inadequacy of the Annual Performance Evaluation Report (APER) system previously used and the Staff Performance Appraisal and Development (SPADEV) Reporting System currently used in the Civil Service of Lagos State, Nigeria and also constitutes a threat to the effectiveness, efficiency and self-sustainability of the administrative organization. This comparative study examined the effect of Learning and Growth (L&G) on Performance Appraisal using The Balanced Scorecard of Objective (BSCO) Method or The Staff Performance Appraisal and Development (SPADEV) Reporting Method in the Civil Service of Lagos State, Nigeria. The study examined the viability of BSCO appraisal system as an alternative to the SPADEV appraisal system.

Descriptive survey design was adopted for this study with Key Informant Interviews (KII). The population comprised fourteen Ministries, the Civil Service Commission (CSC), and the Office of Transformation, Creativity and Innovation (OTCI) with total staff strength of 7,555 in the Lagos State Civil Service. Utilizing Taro Yamane’s sampling technique, a sample size of 380 participants was arrived at, with a thirty percent (30%) addition (to enhance the confidence level and response rate). A self-developed structured questionnaire was used to collect information about variables that formed the basis for assessing the appraisal instruments, BSCO and SPADEV; from the perspective of the level of appropriateness (App). The questionnaire was validated, yielding a Cronbach’s alpha coefficient of 0.830. A total of 494 copies of the questionnaire documents were distributed, with a response rate of about 75%. In addition, two Commissioners and a Director General were interviewed, using interview-guide. Data from the questionnaire were analyzed using descriptive and inferential analyses (p=0.05) while data from the interview were content-analyzed.

Findings revealed that there was significant difference (p<0.003) between BSCO (LGP: \( \bar{x} = 7.16 \)) and SPADEV (LGP: \( \bar{x} = 2.78 \)) for criterion variables assessing the appraisal instruments. Furthermore, analysis of KII revealed BSCO appraisal method to be superior to SPADEV method of appraisal.

The study concluded that BSCO is more viable than SPADEV with consistently significant difference for all variables used in assessing the appraisal instruments. It is therefore clear from the study that BSCO appraisal method is an alternative instrument to SPADEV. It therefore recommended that BSCO should be used as an alternative performance appraisal instrument in the Lagos State Civil Service.
Keywords: Learning and Growth Perspective (L&GP), Balanced Scorecard (BSC), Balanced Scorecard of Objective (BSCO), Staff Performance Appraisal and Development (SPADEV) Reporting System; Key Performance Deliverable (KPD), Key Performance Indicator (KPI), Performance Appraisal (PA), Performance Management (PM)

1.0 Background

The Learning & Growth Perspective (L&GP) is a critical metric in the performance management and appraisal dashboard. Sadly, Line Managers, Supervisors and even some HR folks and Appraisers have either ignored or not accorded sufficient recognition to the L&GP as a barometer to measuring employee Key Performance Deliverables (KPDs) while managing and or appraising employee performance. The concept of L&GP is mostly controversial and relegated to the background, especially by ignorant Line Managers and Appraisers because it is usually regarded as a cost center rather than a revenue center.

2.0: Statement of The Problem

Line Managers, Supervisors and even some HR folks and Appraisers have either ignored or not accorded sufficient recognition to the Learning and Growth perspective (LGP) as a barometer to measuring employee Key Performance Deliverables (KPDs) while managing and or appraising employee performance. The Learning & Growth Perspective (L&GP) is a critical metric in the performance management and appraisal dashboard. The concept of L&GP is mostly controversial and relegated to the background, especially by ignorant Line Managers and Appraisers because it is usually regarded as a cost center rather than a revenue center.

3.0: Objective of The Study

The main objective of this study is to determine the effect of Learning and Growth Perspective (L&GP) as key performance appraisal factor in Balanced Scorecard of Objective (BSCO) as an alternative to Staff Performance Appraisal and Development (SPADEV) Reporting System in the Civil Service of Lagos State, Nigeria.

4.0 Research Question

The research question is focused on providing answers to the following concerns and objectives, *viz*;

‘‘How is Learning and Growth Perspective (L&GP) a useful factor in performance appraisal using Balanced Scorecard of Objective (BSCO) as an alternative to Staff Performance Appraisal and Development (SPADEV) Reporting System in the Civil Service of Lagos State, Nigeria?’’
5.0 Hypothesis
The following Null and Alternate hypothesis were tested at 0.05 level of significance.

H₀: Learning and Growth Perspective (L&GP) is not an effective element of performance appraisal in Balanced Scorecard of Objective (BSCO) as an alternative to Staff Performance Appraisal and Development (SPADEV) Reporting System in the Civil Service of Lagos State, Nigeria.

H₁: Learning and Growth Perspective (L&GP) is an effective element of performance appraisal in Balanced Scorecard of Objective (BSCO) as an alternative to Staff Performance Appraisal and Development (SPADEV) Reporting System in the Civil Service of Lagos State, Nigeria.

6.0 Literature Review
Arguably, there are insufficient literature that interrogated and analyzed the operationalization of Learning and Growth Perspective (L&GP) as an essential element performance appraisal either in Staff Performance Appraisal and Development (SPADEV) Reporting System in the Nigerian Civil Service across-board in general and or linking Balanced Scorecard of Objectives (BSCO) as an alternative to SPADEV both in the Federal Civil Service in general and in the Civil Service of Lagos State, Nigeria.

The literature that were reviewed, analyzed Balanced Scorecard (BSC) as a performance management concept and not as a performance appraisal concept in the strict sense of it and so it is a “natural” phenomenon that also none of the BSC discussed the benefits of BSCO over the SPADEV as Performance Appraisal models. However, both BSCO and SPADEV are sometimes used in a manner that portrayed that they are intertwined with meanings oscillating between performance management and appraisals. This study also identified and filled-in identified gaps through new knowledge gained as part of its contributions to knowledge.
The review of literature adopted the funnel approach due to the dearth of relevant and appropriate research materials on the concept of BSCO as a PA model. This approach is aimed at examining a robust framework of critiques or critical analysis of historical research materials conducted in similar terrain with a view to highlighting and filling – in of the gaps where necessary. The literatures are reviewed hereunder;

6.1: Effect of Learning and Growth Perspective (LGP) on Performance Appraisal

Tsai, Yen, Huang, and Huang (2007) argue that from a resource-based perspective, organization learning is the foundation of a firm to creating their special resources and thereby increasing their competitive advantage. Tsai et al (2007) are of the opinion that organizational learning is derived from individual learning within the organization. However, they posit that many firms have adopted downsizing strategies to reduce the redundancy. Nevertheless, they believe that redundancy have a great impact on both laid-off employees and remaining ones.

This study agrees with Tsai et al (2007) position on the impact of training on organizational performance. However, they would have expanded their position on other alternatives for dealing with redundancy such as improvements in learning and development, organizational expansion and subsequent delegation of more functions among other strategies.

Truitt (2011) argues that it is incumbent on training and development professionals to design, implement, and evaluate the effectiveness of their programmes in reducing disputes in workplace performance. The paper explores the relationships between training experiences and attitudes and about perceived job proficiency. In a sample of 237 full-time salaried/exempt and hourly/non-exempt employees from one academic institution and three businesses in the states of Maryland, Delaware, and Arizona, the study found a direct relationship between one’s positive training experiences and attitudes and one’s proficiency. Truitt (2011) also found that 86.8% of those who had updated training had the most positive attitudes toward training and that 80% of those who had negative training attitudes also had negative views on their proficiency.

Ofobruku and Nwakoby (2015) argued that robust employees training programme will enable business organizations to have the right set of workers with the required skills, knowledge and
attitude to manage the different industries in Nigeria, as well as plan adequately and wisely to meet the challenges of skills deficiency, for the industries in the future. They reviewed the effects of training on employees’ productivity in the insurance industry as well as the challenges militating against employee training in the insurance industry in Nigeria.

Ofobruku et al (2015) evaluated key policies on insurance employee training and development and how it enhances employees’ productivity in the insurance industry. The findings of the study shows that in order for organization to achieve optimum returns from her investment, there is the need to develop training programmes and effectively manage training of employees’, which is the most vital asset of organizations and the dynamic of their productivity. The study concludes that the insurance industry in Nigeria as a matter of urgency should formulate policies that enshrine employees training so as to improve employees’ productivity in the industry, in order to arrest the present poor productive situation.

Ofobruku (2007) agrees with Tritt; (2011) position on the impact and implications of staff training in a organization, stating that training programmes help improve organizational productivity. This study agrees with the above positions about the extent of growth accruable to an organization as a result of the impact of the trainings that employees receive.

Easterby-Smith, Snell, and Gherardi (1998) provide an overview of current debates in the field of organizational learning through the device of examining key ‘divergences’ within the literature. Clear divergences are noted in two areas: first, between the practitioner literature which is primarily engaged in creating learning organizations and the academic literature which is engaged in the study of learning processes in organizations; and, second, in the views of both academics and practitioners about the nature and essence of organizational learning. In addition, but with somewhat less significance, divergences are noted in the preferred ways of investigating and researching into organizational learning, and ways of improving the ability of organizations to learn. The article then identifies power as an issue that has received limited attention in the literature, but which appears to underlie many of the above divergences.
This study agrees with Easterby-Smith et al (1998) which are characteristic of issues of diversionary challenges encountered in organizational learning and growth perspectives. Issues ranging from illiteracy to poverty and mediocre capacity-building etcetera account for diversionary issues which defocuses the employees from organizational objectives.

Baldwin, Danielson, and Wiggenhorn (1997) posit that organizational learning and growth strategies are also affected by the impact of globalization. They further noted that globalization and the restructuring of industry—spurred by the growth and development of information technology, boundryless markets, changing economic and political structures and higher customer expectations—are redefining the underlying logic of business and its processes. Buying, merging, reengineering, and redefining corporations involve identifying the central components of a model for businesses or organizations.

Baldwin et al (1997) corroborate the views of Easterby-Smith et al (1998) on the far-reaching impact of globalization on education in general and organizational learning in particular. This study agrees with Baldwin et al (1997) because the globalization as a phenomenon comes with some level of learning distortions either positively or negatively.

Obi-Anike and Ekwe (2014) sought to determine the nature of the relationship between training/development and organizational effectiveness; to highlight the benefits of training and development in Nigeria public sector and to ascertain the impact of training/development on organizational performances. They noted that there is a relationship between increase in job satisfaction, reduced employee turnover and training and development in public sector.

The study concluded that effective training is an investment in the human resources of an organization, with both immediate and long -range returns. The study recommends that organizations should make training and development of their employees a regular activity. Training has to involve more than just basic skill development. That is, to use training to gain a competitive advantage, organizations should view training broadly as a way to create intellectual capital. This study, partially disagrees with Obi-Anike and Ekwe (2014) because training and development alone does not guarantee job satisfaction for the employee. Studies, according to
(Drucker, 1954) have shown that increase in salaries, more often, motivates employees than any other incentive, especially in the third-world countries like Nigeria.

8.0 Empirical Review of Literature

This has to do with appraisals of previous related scholarly postulations, findings and conclusions. The empirical review enables this study to identify gaps and fill them accordingly so as to facilitate and enhance contribution to knowledge. The empirical review are as summarized in the literature map cum table below.

Empirical Review of The Literature on The Effect of Learning and Growth Perspective (L&GP) on performance appraisal using the Balanced Scorecard of Objective (BSCO) as an alternative to the Staff Performance Appraisal and Development (SPADEV) Reporting methods in the Civil Service of Lagos State, Nigeria.

Table 8.0.1: Empirical Table Summary of Literature Review.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S/N</th>
<th>Author’s Name /Year</th>
<th>Research Title</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Tsai P., Yen C. Y., Huang L., &amp; Huang I. (2007).</td>
<td>A study on motivating employees’ learning commitment in the post-downsizing era: Job satisfaction perspective.</td>
<td>Posited that many firms have adopted downsizing strategies to reduce the redundancy. Nevertheless, they believe that redundancy have a great impact on both laid-off employees and remaining ones. They argued that from a resource-based perspective, organization learning is the foundation of firms creating their special resources and thereby increasing their competitive vantage.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Truitt, D.L (2001)</td>
<td>The Effect of Training and Development on Employee Attitude as it Relates to Training and Work Proficiency</td>
<td>revealed a direct relationship between one’s positive training experiences and attitudes and one’s proficiency. She revealed that 86.8% of those who had updated training had the most positive attitudes toward training and that 80% of those who had negative training attitudes also had negative views on their proficiency.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Ofobruku, S.A., &amp; Nwakoby, N.P., (2015),</td>
<td>Effects of Training on Employees’ Productivity in Nigeria Insurance Industry</td>
<td>Found that in order for organization to achieve optimum returns from her investment, there is the need to develop training programmes and effectively managed training of employees’, which is the most vital asset of organizations and the dynamic of their productivity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Easterby-Smith, M., Snell, R. &amp; Gherardi, S. (1998)</td>
<td>Organizational Learning: Diverging Communities of Practice?</td>
<td>Their study provided an overview of current debates in the field of organizational learning through the device of examining key ‘divergences’ within the literature. Clear divergences are noted in two areas: first, between the practitioner literature which is primarily engaged in creating learning organizations and the academic literature which is engaged in the study of learning processes in organizations; and, second, in the views of both academics and practitioners about the nature and essence of organizational learning.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Baldwin, T. T., Danielson, C. &amp; Wiggenghorn, W. (1997)</td>
<td>The Evolution of Learning Strategies in Organizations: From Employee Development to Business Redefinition</td>
<td>Posited that organizational learning and growth strategies are also affected by the impact of globalization. They further noted that globalization and the restructuring of industry—spurred by the growth and development of information technology, boundary-less</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
markets, changing economic and political structures and higher customer expectations—are redefining the underlying logic of business and its processes.

Obi-Anike, H.O. & Ekwe, M.C., (2014), Impact of Training and Development on Organizational Effectiveness: Evidence from Selected Public Sector Organizations in Nigeria

Found that there is positive relationship between training/development and organizational effectiveness. Inter-personal and teamwork are the effect of training/development on organizational performance. They noted that there is a relationship between increase in job satisfaction, reduced employee turnover and training and development in public sector.

9.0: Gaps in Literature

**Effect of Learning and Growth Perspective (L&GP) on Performance Appraisal using Balanced Scorecard (BSC) as an alternative to Staff Performance Appraisal and Development (SPADEV) Reporting System in Civil Service of Lagos State, Nigeria.**

Table 9.0.1: Summary Table of Gaps In Literature

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S/N</th>
<th>Author’s Name /Year</th>
<th>Research Title</th>
<th>Gaps (Suggestions for further reading)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Tsai P., Yen C. Y., Huang L., &amp; Huang I. (2007).</td>
<td>A study on motivating employees’ learning commitment in the post-downsizing era: Job satisfaction perspective.</td>
<td>Would have weighed-in on providing readers with the benefits and demerits coupled with its implications on the organization, the outgoing staff and those remaining in the organizations. Further studies could be carried out to highlight alternatives to downsizing to sustain organizational growth.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Truitt, D.L. (2001)</td>
<td>The Effect of Training and Development on Employee Attitude as it Relates to Training and Work Proficiency</td>
<td>Did not highlight the circumstances surrounding assimilation of such training programmes. Recommendation is suggested to carry out studies on the impact of alternative motivations for employee experiences and skills at work other than just trainings alone.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Easterby-Smith, M., Snell, R. &amp; Gherardi, S. (1998)</td>
<td>Organizational Learning: Diverging Communities of Practice?</td>
<td>Study appear abstract in providing clarity for readers to understand where and how to draw differences that exists in the divergencies between practitioner literature and academic literature. Further studies are suggested on impact of organizational learning on employee performance on a quarter to quarter and year to year basis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Baldwin, T. T, Danielson, C. &amp; Wigenhorn, W. (1997)</td>
<td>The Evolution of Learning Strategies in Organizations: From Employee Development to Business Redefinition</td>
<td>Failed to take a position on whether or not the impact of globalization on organizational learning is either beneficial or disadvantageous to both the individual employee and the organization.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6. Obi-Anike, H.O. & Ekwe, M.C., (2014), Impact of Training and Development on Organizational Effectiveness: Evidence from Selected Public Sector Organizations in Nigeria. They failed to highlight the flip side of the impact of training on employee development. It would be worthwhile to study what organizational impact would be as a result of poor performance of the employee on training.

Source: Survey findings, (2017)

7.0 Theoretical Underpinning

Theoretical review provides related eclectic postulations and analysis of the a theoretical frameworks for this study, using the Systems Theory (ST). This section would guide the readers to the ideological leanings of the Theorists including the associated alignments and critiques from authors on the theories.

7.1: Systems Theory

System theory was originally based on the postulations of Ludwig V. Bertallanffy (1968) who is regarded as one of the early fathers of general systems theory. The systems theory later carried popularity and was borrowed by experts in other fields such as Law, Religion, Sociology and Political Science.

Systems Theory could be considered a specialization of system thinking alternatively as a goal output of systemic actions and reactions. A central focus of the Systems theory is self-regulatory, i.e. the systems’ self-correction through feedback. Self-regulating systems are found in nature, including to the physiological systems of our body, in local and global ecosystems, and in climate—and in human learning processes (from the individual up through international organizations like the United Nations. (Biel & Mu-Jeong, 2009).

Profiling the customer from internal and external perspectives should not absolve the backend operations staff from aligning their deliverables to ultimately satisfy the external customer. The customer perspective, should be recalibrated to ultimately satisfy the external customer, incidentally, the customer is king because they put food on the employees table. The customer, especially the external one, is so critical in the value-chain because they serve as a barometer to validate the significance of the organizational contribution to socio-economic value chain of any...
country. Therefore, any lag, or over-concentration in providing efficient internal customer services at the detriment or neglect of the external customer, would most likely boomerang to affect the organization from not only increasing their bottom-line but also growing their top line.

The system theory further states that a system is a whole that comprises many parts. In effect, the relationship between the constituent parts and the whole and their contribution towards the survival of the whole system is of utmost importance. Applying this to the public sector and the civil service in particular or different segments within it, it could be seen as a system or sub-system composing of individuals and groups whose effective performance or contributions lead to the attainment of the organizational goals (Oladimeji, 2014).

The Systems Theory, apart from explaining the symbiotic interactions between institutional structures, it also has capacity to trigger pressures that drives the natural desire for change – (Civil Servants in this case) to one type of organizational performance appraisal that may be perceived to be a better one. Hence, the desire and the need for change even to a type of appraisal model that is capable of addressing inherent individual or organizational gaps and needs. This trend shall perhaps continue until the majority of staff get satisfactory performance appraisal models. To follow this line of thought, most organization’s leadership, focus their attention from performance appraisal policies to factors that consciously or unconsciously enhance or discourage performance, thereby stimulating reactions (positive or negative).

Oladimeji (2014) goes further to examine through the adoption of performance appraisal, the contribution of individuals to the attainment of organizational goal and maintenance or sustenance of the existing status. In this sense, the theory postulates harmony rather than conflict between management and employees integration as against competition. (Anifowose, 2006 cited in Alao, Nwogwugwu & Alofe, 2014).

The theory has been criticized to be too abstract, pre-occupied with stability and categorized all variables into input, processing, output and feedback; this does not significantly diminish the adoption of the theory in human relations to understand performance appraisal system in public sector. (Alao et al, 2014 ). Bertalanffy (1968), is widely recognized for his contributions to
science as a Systems Theorist; specifically, for the development of a theory known as General system theory (GST). The theory attempted to provide alternatives to conventional models of organizations. GST defined new foundations and developments as a generalized theory of systems with applications to numerous areas of study, emphasizing holism over reductionism and organism over mechanism. Critical to GST are the inter-relationships between elements which all together form the whole (Bertalanffy, 1968).

The holistic nature of systems theory implies that organizational growth and the resulting associated change are inevitable. In other words, organizations must gravitate to either positive or negative changes because change is the only constant natural phenomenon. The type of change that would trigger multiplier effects in an organization could begin an individual or department. For instance, the need or desire to either retain the employment of existing professionals or for the organization to hire newly skilled professionals. This could result into migration from an existing performance appraisal system or model to another.

Systems theory is therefore adopted to enhance further examination of this research study because in a typical and characteristic self-regulating manner, organizational concepts, including performance appraisals, are dynamic, hence change becomes the only constant thing. Change could be orchestrated or triggered by several factors such as new knowledge, dissatisfaction with existing systems or even by mere association or socialization, etcetera

In the same manner, SPADEV as an existing performance appraisal system is currently grappling with enormous difficulties in the face of competing existing performance appraisal alternatives, both in the public and in the private sectors. It therefore becomes logical that if the Lagos State Government through its Civil Service wants to be ‘‘on the same page’’ or come to appreciable speed with the private sector, which she is meant to moderate, supervise and regulate, it is in her best interest to adopt improved or updated contemporary organizational models and strategies. For example, in the area of performance appraisal models in other not to be beaten in the organizational war-room.
Similarly, the fundamental inadequacies of SPADEV, has crystallized into yearnings and clamour by the Civil Servants for a change, hence the need for consideration of BSCO as an alternative to SPADEV performance appraisal model. However, there are associated shortcomings with the systems theory. The Systems Theory may not be adequately flexible to embrace rapid and recurrent agitations and probably reflect or project them as often as they are generated due largely to the strength of the agitations that would attract policy attention and subsequent conversion into output or policy.

This is because it is difficult for institutional policies to be as fluid or dynamic as the agitations that are generated at the informal individual or group levels. Hence agitations and pressures in the Systems Theory are mainly given attention mostly because they usually become burning or critical systemic issues and in some cases, some lives or valuable possessions would have been endangered or lost, thereby attracting institutional intervention and restructuring to address the concerns, which is usually the situation in organizations that care less.

8.0: Methodology

The study adopted the descriptive survey research method. The questionnaire survey instrument, review and analysis of literature as well as Key Informant Interviews (KII) were used to carry out the survey. The quantitative and qualitative data sources and collection methods were used in the study. The quantitative method dwells on the collation and articulation of data generated from the measuring (questionnaire) instrument, including the numerical measurement between variables, while the qualitative data focuses on the social processes that give rise to the relationships, interactions, and constraints of the research survey inquiries, including literature reviews and analysis. Part of the qualitative and quantitative values are to be captured in the responses of the sample population in the questionnaire data collection. (Howell, 2013).

The rationale for this methodology is to enable the researcher make use of existing literatures, administer questionnaires and conduct guided interviews in order to arrive at appropriate findings.
8.1: Population Distribution, Sample Size and Sampling Technique

Table 8.1.1 Summary of Population Distribution, Sample Size And Technique of the Selected Ministries in the Lagos State Civil Service (CSC) and also the Office of Transformation, Creativity and Innovation (OTCI) and their sample sizes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S/N</th>
<th>Ministry</th>
<th>Staff Strength</th>
<th>Sample size</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Commerce, Industry and Co-operatives</td>
<td>228</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Economic Planning and Budget</td>
<td>233</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>451</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Environment</td>
<td>674</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Establishment, Training and Pensions</td>
<td>188</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Health</td>
<td>771</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Information and Strategy</td>
<td>263</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Justice</td>
<td>1434</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Physical Planning and Urban Development</td>
<td>838</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Science and Technology</td>
<td>262</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Special Duties &amp; Inter-Governmental Relations</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Wealth Creation and Employment</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Works and Infrastructure</td>
<td>1,185</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Youth and Social Development</td>
<td>655</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Civil Service Commission</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Office of Transformation, Creativity and Innovation</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>7,555</td>
<td>380</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Lagos State Public Service Commission (2017)

Table 8.1.2: Summary Table of Survey Instrument and Validity of Statistics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>N0. Of Items</th>
<th>Guttman Split-Half</th>
<th>Composite Reliability</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Learning and Growth Perspective and Performance Appraisal</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.8212</td>
<td>0.7689</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Research Study 2017

It was proved that the questionnaire developed and used for evaluating the Effect of Learning & Growth (L&G) perspective in Balanced Scorecard of Objective (BSCO) as an alternative to Staff Performance Appraisal and Development (SPADeV) Reporting System in the Civil Service of Lagos State, Nigeria, was valid for the study.
Table 8.1.3: Reliability Test – Cronbach’s Alpha for Studied Variables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Cronbach’s Alpha Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Learning and Growth Perspective and Performance Appraisal</td>
<td>0.8116</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: SPPSS Output Result 2017

9.0: Data Analysis

Two hundred and eighty (280) questionnaires were retrieved from the respondents and analysed using SPSS (Statistical Product and Service Solutions; Version 21) data analysis software. The total number of questionnaires retrieved represented approximately 5.5% or 20 questionnaires more than the calculated sample size. The findings of the primary and secondary sources of data were analyzed to determine the validity or otherwise of the research hypotheses.

9.1: Method of Data Analysis

Linear regression analysis was used to test the significance of the appropriateness of BSCO or SPADEV and performance appraisal. Data from the questionnaire were analyzed using descriptive statistics and inferential analyses ($P=0.05$). The study also used comparison of mean and paired t-test while data from the interview were content-analyzed. The summary of results of the research findings are as stated in the Table 11.1.1 and subsequent presentations as follows;

Table 9.1.1: To evaluate the effect of Learning and Growth Perspective using the BSCO and SPADEV in the Lagos State Civil Service

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Min</th>
<th>Max</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SPADEV adequately measures my performance from the learning and growth perspective during appraisal exercises</td>
<td>280</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.38</td>
<td>.630</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BSCO adequately measures my performance from the learning and growth perspective during appraisal exercises</td>
<td>280</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3.54</td>
<td>.832</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In the SPADEV system, my participation in training programmes are periodically evaluated to check the impact on my deliverables</td>
<td>280</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.39</td>
<td>.729</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In the BSCO system, my participation in training programmes are periodically evaluated to check the impact on my deliverables</td>
<td>280</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3.62</td>
<td>.756</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Details from the analysis of Table 9.1.1, shows that the respondents, with Mean=1.38 and SD=.630 are of the opinion that the SPADEV appraisal document adequately measures their performance from the learning and growth perspective during appraisal exercises, compared to the respondents, with Mean=3.54 and SD=.832, who stated that the BSCO appraisal document
adequately captures their performance from the learning and growth perspective during appraisal exercises.

The respondents, with Mean=1.39 and SD=.729, indicated that, in the SPADEV appraisal system, their participation in training programmes are periodically evaluated to check the impact on their deliverables, compared to the respondents, with Mean=3.62 and SD=.756, who indicated that, in the BSCO appraisal system, their participation in training programmes are periodically evaluated to check the impact on their deliverables. The increase in the compliance to periodic evaluations of the impact of training programmes in the BSCO system, is as a result of the in-built checks, monitoring provisions and mechanisms of the BSCO appraisal system to enhance compliance on the part of staff.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>SPADEV (Mean ± SD)</th>
<th>BSCO (Mean ± SD)</th>
<th>Mean Difference</th>
<th>T- Statistics</th>
<th>P. value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Evaluate the effect of Learning and Growth Perspective using the BSCO and SPADEV in the Lagos State Civil Service.</td>
<td>280</td>
<td>2.7754 ± 1.105</td>
<td>7.1594 ± 1.384</td>
<td>-4.38406</td>
<td>-35.910</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A paired-sample t-test was conducted to compare the effect of learning and growth perspective in Balanced Scorecard of Objective (BSCO) as an alternative to Staff Performance Appraisal and Development (SPADEV) Reporting System in the Civil Service of Lagos State, Nigeria. Results in Table 9.1.2 reveals that there was a significant difference recorded in establishing and evaluating the effect of appraising performance from learning and growth perspective using the BSCO (Mean=7.1594 ± SD=1.384) and SPADEV (Mean=2.7754 ± SD=1.105) methods of appraisal with a Mean difference=-4.38406, t(278)= -35.910 and p=.001 in the Civil Service of Lagos State, Nigeria.

10.0: Hypothesis Testing And Decision Rule

The pre-set level of significance for this study is 0.05. The null hypothesis assumes a negative or contrasting disposition to the positive impact of BSCO in the performance appraisal of the Lagos State Civil Service. The null hypotheses are embodiments of the statement that Learning and
Growth perspective (L&GP) will not be impactful on performance appraisal using the Balanced Scorecard of Objectives (BSCO) and Staff Performance Appraisal and Development (SPADEV) as an alternative in the Civil Service of Lagos State, Nigeria.

On the other hand, the alternative hypotheses assumes a positive disposition in the null hypothetical dispositions. On the whole, if the P-value (that is, the significance or the probability value) is less than or equal to the level of significance (which is 0.05), the null hypotheses will be rejected and the alternative hypotheses will be accepted.

10.1: Null and Alternate Hypothesis:

The Null hypothesis are as stated below;

$H_0$: Learning and growth perspective will not be impactful on performance appraisal using the Balanced Scorecard of Objective (BSCO) as an Alternative to Staff Performance Appraisal and Development (SPADEV) Reporting System in the Civil Service of Lagos State, Nigeria.

The Alternative hypothesis are as stated below;

$H_1$: Learning and growth perspective will be impactful on performance appraisal using the Balanced Scorecard of Objective (BSCO) as an alternative to Staff Performance Appraisal and Development (SPADEV) Reporting System in the Civil Service of Lagos State, Nigeria.

11.0: Results and Discussion of Findings

The synopsis of the analysis and findings of this study indicate that the respondents are of the opinion that, generally, regardless of the associated challenges, the Financial Perspective (FP) is useful and can be effectively implementation in the Balanced Scorecard of Objective (BSCO) as an alternative to Staff Performance Appraisal and Development (SPADEV) Reporting System in the Civil Service of Lagos State, Nigeria.
Through performance appraisal, organizations are capable of knowing the weaknesses and strengths of its employees in order to re-enforce the strengths and improve on the weaknesses for the overall benefit of the employees and the organization (Ijewereme, 2013).

The content of the measuring instruments were developed to reflect the research objectives. The findings of the study in relation to the research questions and objectives are discussed below.

11.1: Restatement of Research Objective and Findings

To Evaluate the Effect of Learning and Growth Perspective in Balanced Scorecard of Objective (BSCO) as an alternative to Staff Performance Appraisal and Development (SPADEV) Reporting System in the Civil Service of Lagos State, Nigeria.

The study evaluated and found that the BSCO method has a better effect of learning and growth appraisal than in the SPADEV method in the performance appraisal of the Lagos State Civil Service. Establishing the effect of appraising performance from learning and growth perspective using the BSCO and SPADEV methods of appraisal in the Lagos State Civil Service on a paired sample t-test revealed that SPADEV recorded a Mean ± SD of 2.7754 ± 1.105 while BSCO recorded a Mean ± SD of 7.1594 ± 1.384 indicating a mean difference of -4.38406, a t-statistics of -35.910 and a P value .001. The study found that most of the respondents were of the opinion that staff performance could be measured from the ‘learning and growth perspective.

Regardless of whether they have benefited from training programmes in their organizations or not, most of the respondents believed that appropriate trainings programmes contributed to both their personal and organizational development and that their performances on the job improves if they undergo adequate training programmes. In addition, most respondents are of the opinion that the impact of trainings on the job can be measured. In the words of the Permanent Secretary of the Ministry of Information and Strategy, “If you don’t train them, don’t blame them”. The philosophy is that, it is only when you have trained a competent workforce that the organization can justifiably expect commensurate performance improvement on the job, the exigencies however, depends on the type and level of the job function.
It is possible that, with the impact of learning and growth in the organization, subordinates would be better equipped with the skills to conduct effective and efficient performance appraisals in their respective organizations. The above position is corroborated by the postulations of Adnan, Iftikhar, Shakeel, and Fraz, (2010) who examined the impact of the research gap existing in performance appraisal (PA) gaps in Pakistani organizations. The researchers explored the relationship between performance appraisal (PA) satisfaction, job satisfaction and turnover intentions in semi-governmental organizations in Pakistan. From their findings which was collected from 123 responses, they found statistically significant relationships between studied variables.

The results have significant policy implications for improving the process of performance appraisal in semi-governmental organizations in Pakistan as well as other developing countries. Some other studies, especially as conducted by Moussavi and Ashbaugh (1995) and Murphy and Cleveland (1995), suggested that appraisal satisfaction is a key factor leading job satisfaction. This is because sometimes employee’s decision to remain in a particular employment is usually a function of job satisfaction. Performance improvements and job satisfaction go hand-in-hand, and sometimes, it is not achieved overnight, literarily, but a function of the impact of learning and growth which has occurred on the job over time.

The position above was further supported by Malik, Mushtaq, Muhammad, Seemal and Adeel (2014), posit that performance gaps can be addressed by training, although that is only a part of the solutions of addressing performance gaps, but to the extent that they have identified training as part of the solutions, corroborates the findings of this study where the respondents opined that learning and growth would not only improve their performance on the job but also that the impact of learning on their performance can be measured. Malik et al (2014) concluded that fair performance evaluation and proper training motivates employees, results in improved performance and helps to achieve organizational competitiveness.

12.0: Conclusion and Recommendation

At this juncture, it would be appropriate to conclude on the position of the study and also proffer recommendations based on associated findings of the study.
12.1: Conclusion

Performance evaluation in the Lagos State Civil Service has undergone series of bureaucratic, structural and administrative transformations devoid of the Learning and Growth perspective (LGP) ranging from the era of Confidential System, to the Annual Performance Evaluation Reporting system (APER), to the Staff Performance Appraisal and Development (SPADEV) reporting system, and to the current status where they are using the Revitalized SPADEV. Regardless of these transitions, performance appraisals were still replete with difficulties as the exercises usually measured traits rather than actual performances.

Nevertheless, the current performance appraisal system which is the revitalized SPADEV, has also failed to address performance appraisal from a balanced perspective. The current system is unable to measure performance from the BSC/BSCO quadrant of learning and growth perspective of performance appraisal, amongst other deficiencies. In spite of these performance appraisal types and appraisal reforms, performance appraisal systems in the Lagos State Civil Service are still not able to achieve the set objective of effectively measuring performance due largely to attitudinal and institutional challenges. Effective and efficient management of performance appraisal could still be achieved by ensuring that it does not merely measure traits but by connecting performance appraisal with appropriate rewards and positive customers perception with the use of objective criteria.

Performance appraisal exercises ought to be a recurrent cycle before performance management could be regarded as complete. This is because performance appraisals provide feedback on the employee's performance in the organizational value-chain. On the basis of the performance appraisal results or feedback, the organization can decide whether to promote, demote, transfer or terminate the employee. Pay increments and disciplinary actions can also be aligned to performance appraisals. Resources for rewards are allocated using performance appraisals feedback mechanism which facilitates communication flow, organizational diagnosis and development. The superiors and subordinates should both take each other as partners and work towards attainment of organizational goals and objectives.
The Human Resources Departments in organizations establishes performance criteria and standards that would eventually act as performance benchmarks through the key performance indicators (KPIs) and the key performance deliverables (KPDs). Then the superior who is conducting the appraisal communicates the job descriptions, targets and goals to be achieved at the end of the year to the subordinate who is being appraised. Thereafter the actual appraisal takes place and the results are tabulated by the HR department. The tabulated results are analyzed thoroughly and objectively to measure the tangible and actual performance. In the end, the organization takes corrective and remedial measures based on the results derived from the performance of the employees.

From the point of view of the sample population, due to the factors of human and institutional impediments, the performance appraisal systems hitherto implemented in the Lagos State Civil Service including the current appraisal system have been unable to neither meet nor surpass the objectives for which they were set to achieve. The findings of this study shows that the Balanced Scorecard of Objectives (BSCO) could be a more objective performance appraisal method in spite of the associated challenges facing the revitalized SPADEV. In other words, the BSCO, if appropriately implemented, has the wherewithal to achieve effective and efficient achievement of set performance appraisal objectives in the Lagos State Civil Service.

From the employee’s point of view, there are several benefits that are derived through the performance appraisal exercise. Firstly, the employee gets a very clear cut understanding of his job duties, authority and responsibility in the organization. Secondly, the employee is appraised of his upward and downward periods in performance. When the upward periods are rewarded, the employee's morale is boosted tremendously and when the downward periods are reprimanded, he takes care not to repeat the same mistakes in the future.

12.2: Recommendation

Based on the findings of this study, recommendations were proffered to enhance the significance of the research exercise. The recommendations are as follows;
The Learning and Growth structure of an organization should be aligned in a fashion that enhances continuous employee training and retraining for optimal efficiency on the job.

The organizational periodic training chart should be crafted to a tailor-made and purpose built model rather than mere generic training calendar to improve employee expertise and enhance return on investment.

Learning and Growth Perspective should be integrated into performance management and appraisal structure of organizations.

Learning and Growth Perspective should be adopted with Balanced Scorecard of Objective (BSCO) method for maximum benefits over Staff Performance Appraisal and Development (SPADEV) Reporting System.

Organizations should encourage multi-faceted learning and growth cycles to include on-the-job learning, open training programmes, ad hoc trainings, simulations, in-plant trainings, CEO’s workshops, Director’s Seminars etc.

The human resources and or training departments of organizations should co-create industry Learning and Growth contents with academic institutions in a manner that would enhance synergy and promote seamless bridge between theory and industry experience.

Periodic Learning and Growth perspective (LGP) for employee performance management should be flexible and dynamic to capture need-based areas during appraisal sessions. In other words, only areas of previous deficiencies should attract higher appraisal weights and expectations for improvement in the subsequent appraisal sessions.

High net-worth trainings should attract organizational bonding and or partnership arrangements with beneficiaries to enhance employee retention and mitigate unnecessary attritions.
Regulatory training agencies should make employee learning and developments attractive and mandatory for organizations to qualify for status of manpower recognition, certification and license to operate.

Employee personal developments should be encouraged to embrace informal soft training skills for periodic developments and assessments.

13.0: References


Cronbach, L.J (1951), Coefficient alpha and the internal structure of tests. Psychomerika. 1951;16:297-334. 10.1007/BF02310555


Truitt, D.L, (2011), The Effect of Training and Development on Employee Attitude as it Relates to Training and Work Proficiency, VL - 1, *SAGE Journals*
