

place to meet, relax and rub mind. This is in line with the history of shopping malls where it was first consider as a place to socialize.

(g) Promotional Activities: one of the key attributes of malls is promotional activities. Many brands choose malls as a place to launch their products and offer promotions like price discounts, buy two, get one for free and so on. Many malls are always offering discounts during festivities like Christmas, Easter, Ramadan Fasting, Eid-el-Kabir and some other national holidays. Some customers of malls go to the extent of offering a raffle draw where winners win different prizes. This also endears customers to them.

Empirical review

Many scholars had written on the impacts of shopping malls on retail and traditional business and a host of others had exploited the preference of one shopping mall to another.

Shanmuganandavadivel (2016) in his research explore on the impact of mega shopping malls on the small retail business sector in Coimbatore City of India. The study utilized survey method and used interview schedules to obtain data Stratified random and judgement sampling technique was used to select 180 respondents who are all retailers. The findings showed that mega shopping malls have an adverse effects on small retail business. It further recommended that small retailers should come together to form a partnership or limited liability company so as to compete with these mega shopping malls.

Jaafaru (2018) investigated the correlates of consumer patronage of shopping mall in metropolitan Lagos. Survey method, questionnaire and interview schedule was used in data collection. Simple random sampling was used to select 300 respondents. Descriptive and Inferential statistics mainly regression was used to analysed the data obtained. Result shows that

ambience of shopping malls, assortment of stores; sales promotions and comparative economic gains in the malls attract higher customer traffic to the malls.

Acholla (2017) examined consumer patronage and perception towards shopping malls in east of Nairobi County. Convenience sampling was used to select 240 customers of which 138 filled the questionnaire. The data collected was analysed using Regression analysis. The study found a statistically significant relationship between customer experience with store aspects and customer perceptions.

McGreevy (2016) in his study examined the economic and employment impacts of shopping mall developments on regional and peri-urban Australian towns. The study explored the short and long term effects of shopping malls on Australian regional towns. Workplace data were compared before and after the opening of major malls in three Australia regional towns and between nine towns that have had either shopping malls or traditional town centres for over 20 years. The study found no evidence of increases in economic activity over the short term following the opening of a major shopping mall and evidence of diminished economic activity and employment over the long term.

Thomas (2018) Krejcie & Morgan (1970) formula was used for determining sample size and selecting 400 respondents who were shopping malls customers across tier II cities of Rajasthan of which 372 completed the survey.

Makgopa (2016) in his study “Determining Consumers’ Reasons for Visiting Shopping Malls” investigated the main reasons customers visit shopping malls and their frequency of visit. Non-probability quota sampling technique was used to select 108 respondents and interviewer-administered questionnaire was used to collect quantitative data from them. Data collected was analysed using descriptive statistics. The result shows that consumers visit malls for several reasons which are beyond purchase of product but also for entertainment reasons which includes

watching movies, celebrating special occasions among others. The study recommended mall managers and retailers to increase promotional activities to enhance shoppers experience.

Theoretical Review

Theory of Planned Behavior (TPB)

This theory was propounded by Ajzen in 1988. It attempted to forecast certain behaviours and decisions (Acholla, 2017). It is defined as “a complex set of attitudinal, subjective, and perceived behavioral control variables, influences behavioral intention” (Acholla, 2017). The theory posits that certain behavior is the outcome of intentions, but cognitive of perceived behavioral control (Ajzen, 2006 in Acholla, 2017).

Behavioral beliefs revealed that attitudes both acceptable and unacceptable can bring about a behavior. Normative beliefs depict that pressure from the social class or subjective norms, perceived behavioral control result from perceived restrictions and controls. Consumer attitude, influence on subjective norms and their perceptions towards a behavior to a large extent influences their consumption and purchase decisions.

The theory examines the chain of events that guide consumer patronage behavior and provide specific guidelines on the factors that possibly influence such behavior. It opined that consumers patronage behavior is controlled by attitudes and goals formed before the exact customers' behavior.

Theory of Buyer Behavior

Acholla (2017) noted that the theory of buyer behavior was developed as an advancement of the first consumer decision-model in 1969 by Howard and Sheth. It consists of variables called “input variables” which refers to the external environmental elements customers are exposed to. These factors are developed from a variety of sources including price, quality,

availability, brands, distinctive and service. Acholla (2017) observed that the symbolic ones are quality, price, distinctive, availability, service, social status and environment.

Du Plessis, & Rousseau, (1991) in Acholla (2017) noted that products and brands are the major elements consumer focused on. He referred to them as significant stimuli. Product representations and brands are the symbolic stimuli done through advertising and affects the consumer directly. Peer group, age group, family and other groups are the major source of social stimuli. These social stimuli are mostly internalize by consumers before making buying decisions.

Acholla (2017) observed that the hypothetical constructs is influenced by the available information, bias, sensitivity and the ability to have restrictions and control on perception. Exogenous variables like significance of purchase, personality variables, social class, organizational culture, economic status and time pressure can hugely impact buying decisions. The theory posit that the resulting outcome which represents consumers decision making process are knowledge of need, intention development, actual purchase, attention and attitudes.

The theory accounts for a range of variables affecting human behavior including significant stimuli, social stimuli and symbolic stimuli.

Perceived Behavioral Control

This is concerned about the individual belief of having the important resources, skills and awareness to carry out a particular behavior. Shim et al., (2001) in Partney (2010) noted that PBC has more influence on purchase intentions than attitude.

This research will adopt theory of buyer behaviour as it consists variables called “input variables” which refers to the external environmental elements customers are exposed to. These factors are developed from a variety of sources including price, quality, availability, brands, distinctive and service.

Critique of related literature and gaps in the Literature

Many scientific literature have been reviewed on this study, however, this literature reviewed on the Customers Patronage Preference for Shopping Malls over Retail Stores in Ibadan with preference to customers buying behaviour. This research filled the gap by focusing extensively on customers patronage preference. Also, previous research on Customers Patronage Preference for Shopping Malls over Retail Stores were carried out in other parts and other countries. This research filled the gap by focusing on Determinants of Customers Patronage Preference for Shopping Malls over Retail Stores in Ibadan.

Furthermore, despite a growing number of study in this research, there has been no stable results on the variables of customer patronage preference and the findings differs across countries. The diversity of findings in this area depends not only on the method adopted for this study, but also on the constructed research model and the context of the research.

METHODOLOGY

Research Design

Survey design was used because it involves the usage of self-designed questionnaire and interview schedule for data collection.

Study Area

The study focus on shopping malls in Ibadan metropolis. Ibadan is the capital city of Oyo State and largest city in Nigeria. There are sixteen (16) major shopping malls in Ibadan. However this study focus on five (5) most prominent ones which are;

- Cocoa Mall
- Heritage Mall
- Palm shopping Mall

- Jericho Mall and;
- Ventura Mall.

Population and Sample

Population of the study consist customers of shopping malls in Ibadan which number is difficult to ascertain.

A total of 385 respondents were utilized for this study.

Sample Size Determination

Purposive sampling technique was used to select and administer the study questionnaire on mall shoppers who have patronized or still patronizing small retail business.

The sample size was determined using Cochran (1977) formula.

Therefore, the sample size for this research study is **385**

Administration of Data Instrument

The major instrument used in this research was self-designed semi-structured questionnaire which allow respondents to also express their mind and enable me to get more in-depth information from them on patronage of shopping malls over retail stores in Nigeria.

The questionnaire was divided into two sections; Section A will focus on demographic information such as age, marital status, education, income, occupation etc. Section B elicit information on the factors responsible for the patronage of shopping malls over small retail shops in Ibadan. Five Likert model will be used in designing the questionnaires and respondents choose between Strongly Agree (SA), Agree (A), Undecided (U), Disagree (D) and Strongly Disagree (SD).

The researcher personally take the validated questionnaires to the selected shopping malls with research assistance in Ibadan, distribute them and make clarifications where necessary. All aspects of the questionnaire were explained to the respondents and the confidentiality of the information supplied were guaranteed.

Validity and Reliability of Instrument

Ten percentage of the questionnaire was taking to the field to test if it can provide necessary and needed data for testing and analyzing the study hypotheses. Reliability test was carried out using Cronbach's alpha coefficient to measure the internal consistency and test the integrity of the research instrument. From the analysis, the cronbach's alpha coefficient is 0.859 which is greater than the required 0.70. The result shows that there is a good level of internal consistency in the data collected.

Method of Data Analysis

Multiple linear regression analysis deal with the estimation and test of significance. The data was computed and analyzed using Statistical Package for Social Science (SPSS) version.

DATA PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS

Regression result 1: Analyse the impact of economic factors on the patronage of shopping malls over small retail stores in Ibadan.

Coefficients^a

Model	Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.
	Beta		
(Constant)		11.722	0.000
1			
Decoration	-0.140	-2.661	0.008
Customer Care and Relations	-0.195	-3.897	0.000
Socialization	0.173	3.338	0.001
parking spaces	-0.020	-0.392	0.695

a. Dependent Variable: Malls are more secured compare to retail stores

R Square: 0.084; Adjusted R Square: 0.074

Interpretation

Decoration, Customer care and relation as well as parking spaces have negative relationship with the security of the malls. This implies that Decoration, Customer care and relation as well as parking spaces have no influence on the security of the shopping malls. Socialization has a positive relationship with the security of the malls. This implies that socialization have an

influence on the security of the shopping malls Customer care and relation are statistically significant at 1%, Decoration are statistically significant at 1%, while socialization is also statistically significant at 1%.

Regression result 2: determine the effect of cognitive factors on the patronage of shopping malls over small retail stores in Ibadan.

Coefficients^a

Model	Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.
	Beta		
(Constant)		10.768	0.000
Offerings of variety of goods	0.031	0.632	0.528
Several modes of payment	-0.167	-3.408	0.001
Prestige	-0.096	-2.025	0.044
Value addition by housing outlet that adds value to product	0.034	0.699	0.485
Exhibition shows	0.013	0.268	0.789
Promotional activities	-0.360	-7.343	0.000
Price discounts	0.098	2.057	0.040

a. Dependent Variable: Shopping malls offer quality products compared to retail stores

Interpretation

Offerings of variety of goods, Value addition by housing outlet that adds value to product, Exhibition shows and Price discounts have a positive relationship with the quality of products offered by the shopping malls. This implies that Offerings of variety of goods, Value addition by

housing outlet that adds value to product, Exhibition shows and Price discounts have an influence on the quality of products offered by the shopping malls. Several modes of payment, Prestige and Promotional activities have negative relationship with the quality of products offered by the shopping malls. This implies that several modes of payment, Prestige and Promotional activities have no influence on the quality of products offered by the shopping malls. Several modes of payment is significant at 1%, prestige is significant at 1%, promotional activities is significant at 1% and price discount is as well significant at 1%

Discussion of result

The regression model indicated that Socialization has a positive relationship with the security of the malls, Offerings of variety of goods, Value addition by housing outlet that adds value to product, Exhibition shows and Price discounts have a positive relationship with the quality of products offered by the shopping malls. The result is consistence with past research. (Jaafaru 2018) investigated the correlates of consumer patronage of shopping mall in metropolitan Lagos. He found that ambience of shopping malls, assortment of stores; sales promotions and comparative economic gains in the malls attract higher customer traffic to the malls. Also the study of Acholla (2017) examined consumer patronage and perception towards shopping malls in east of Nairobi County. The study found a statistically significant relationship between customer experience with store aspects and customer perceptions.

Customer patronage of the shopping malls tend to be influenced by the ambience of the shopping mall and convenience. This include peripheral mall ambience, inside mall ambience which consists of decoration, flowers and vegetation. Air-conditioning, public address system, recreational place, hall way and shopping space, relaxing benches and terrace attraction. The peripheral mall ambience includes car parking, security standards, and easy access to public transport from the mall.

- The findings also showed that shopping malls adapt marketing strategies to attract patronage. These are creative sales events, product demonstration, in store advertising, customer interaction, recreation and newness of products.
- Data analysis further revealed that product attribute which include quality of the product, price, availability of new product and product value act, as stimulus in influencing consumer choice of shopping malls.
- The result also established that there is a relationship between the shopping malls patronage and economic factors. It can be seen that a good portion of the sample belong to all class of the society as their average income is less than 30,000 per monthly.

SUMMARY, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Summary of findings

This study examined the Determinants of Customers Patronage Preference for Shopping Malls over Retail Stores in Ibadan. Researcher result from the survey findings shows that consumers derive more satisfaction on multiple counts like wider choice of products and well-known brands, one stop shopping, new market arrivals, festive offers, huge discounts, and other benefits. The results indicated that almost all income groups are benefiting from shopping mall purchases. Most of the consumers agreed that they benefits in terms of low pricing when they shop with malls. Two hypothesis were formulated in the research, the result shows there is positive significant of the hypothesis tested which are;

Hypothesis I:

Hi: There is significance impact of economic factors on the patronage of shopping malls over retail stores in Ibadan.

Hypothesis II:

Hi: There is significance effect of cognitive factors on the patronage of shopping malls over retail stores in Ibadan.

Conclusion

Today, there have been increase in customers patronising shopping due to several factors which has effect on patronage, survival of small retail stores. In examining the determinants of customers' patronage preference for shopping malls over retail stores in Ibadan shows that shopping at malls is highly influenced by demographic factors, cognitive and economic variables. Consumer patronage of the shopping malls in Ibadan tends to be influenced by the ambience of the shopping mall and convenience which attract increase in number of customers to the malls. The ambience include peripheral mall ambience like car parking, good security network, restroom, access to public transport from the mall. The inside mall ambience consists of showers and vegetation, air-conditioning, lighting, recreational centre, cinema, CCTV, exhibition, hall way and shopping space, relaxing benches and terrace attraction.

Shopping malls adopt several marketing strategies to attract patronage which includes creative sales events, product demonstration, in store advertising, customer interaction, recreation and newness of products.

Product attributes which include quality of the products, durability, price, availability of new product and product value act as stimulus in influencing consumer choice of shopping malls.

The development and growth of shopping malls and leisure facility center in Nigeria is grid around customer satisfaction in reference point to selection, atmosphere, convenience, attractions, sales people; refreshments policy (Anselmsson, 2006). The development and growth in marketing and the current growth in the Nigerian economy like increase in population, customer awareness, infrastructure development, globalization, technological advancement and deregulation have improve business and marketing activities in Nigeria. The study seeks to

examine study examined the determinants of customers patronage preference for Shopping Malls over Retail Stores in Ibadan

The study reveals that shopping arousal is largely driven by mall attractions, interpersonal influence, sales promotion and competitive gains among customers in reference to recreational facilities in place, location, reference to products and services, brand value and price.

Promotional attractions have a positive advantage on customer patronage of shopping malls. Promotional attractions include: display of product, in-store ambience, availability, length of promotion and value added advantages.

The study examined that there is a relationship between the shopping malls sales growth and lower, middle and upper class patronage. It can be argued that a good portion of the sample belongs to the middle class and upper class of the society as their average income is more than N30, 000 monthly. Also from the survey result, it can be observed that those who have higher income prefer to patronize shopping malls over retail stores.

Recommendations

Based on findings of the study, the following recommendations are proffered;

- Promotional effects generated from various promotional tools should be monitored for longer periods of time and measured in reference to achieving the long-term goals of the shopping malls. Variability of promotional response in different retail channels and outlets should be analyzed for making required modification in line of delivery of promotional programs to the customers.
- Shopping malls should improve and maintain their standard in ambience related variables such as recreation places, lighting, air condition, hall way and shopping space among others as it attract customers to patronize shopping malls over retail stores.

- Shopping mall management to increase social and recreational facilities in the malls.
- The government should ensure free flow of traffic around malls so that even non users of the malls are not inconvenient. Hence, Government should monitor the sitting of malls in the city.

References

- Acholla, C. (2017). Consumer patronage and perception towards shopping malls in east of Nairobi County. *Journal of international marketing*, 7(5).
- Ajzen, I. (1988). The theory of planned behaviour. *Organizational Behaviour, and Human Decision Processes*, 50(2), 179-211.
- Ajzen, I. (2006). Constructing a theory of planned behaviour questionnaire: Conceptual and methodological consideration.
- Ambavale, S.(2013). Consumers' attitude towards online shopping: Factors influencing employees of crazy domain to shop online. *Journal of Management and Market Research*, 14, 1-11.
- Du Plessis, P., & Rousseau, G. & Blem N.H. (1991). Consumer behaviour. A south African perspective. Pretoria. Sigma.
- Ezeh D.P., & Harris L.,(2007) services cape research: A review and a research agenda. *Marketing review*, 7(1), 59-78.
- Jaafaru, B. U.(2018). Correlates of consumer patronage of shopping mall in metropolitan Lagos. *Texila International Journal of Management*, 4(2), 1-21.
DOI:10.21522/TIJMG.2015.04.02.Art008
- Kalhan, A. (2017). Impact of malls on small shops and hawkers. *Economic and Political weekly*, 6, 2063-2066.
- Knox S., & Denison T. (2000). Its impact on retail revenue. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer services*, 7(1), 33-45. Doi: doi.org/10.1016/S0969-6989(98)00033-2
- Krejcie, D., & Morgan W. (1970) Viability of Exploratory Factor Analysis as a Precursor to Confirmatory Factor Analysis. *Structural Equation Modeling*, 3(1), 62-72.
- Makgopa, S. (2016). Determining consumers' reasons for visiting shopping malls. *Innovative Marketing*, 12(2), 22-27. doi:10.21511/im.12(2).2016.03

- Mathews, V. (2018). Impact of shopping malls on small retail outlets-A study in Kollam city, Kerala. *International Journal of Research and Analytical Reviews*, 5(3), 1408-1417. <http://ijrar.com/>
- McGreevy, B. (2016). The economic and employment impacts of shopping mall developments on regional and peri-urban Australian towns. *The service Industries Journal*, 22(1), 122-146.
- Patney, M. B.(2010) "Indian consumers and their mall patronage: Application of cultural-self and the theory of planned behavior to patronage intentions". *Graduate Theses and Dissertations*. 11749. <https://lib.dr.iastate.edu/etd/11749>
- Sadachar, A. (2014). *Indian consumers' patronage intention towards shopping malls: Application of an experience economy perspective*.
- Shanmuganandavadivel, J. (2016). A study on the impact of mega shopping malls on small retail business sector. *International Journal of Advanced Research (IJAR)*, 4(8), 1569-1573. DOI:10.21474/IJAR01/1363
- Shim, S., Eastlick, M. A., Lotz, S. L., & Warrington, P. (2001). An online prepurchase intentions model: The role of intention to search. *Journal of Retailing*, 77, 397–416.
- Singh, H., & Srinivason, S. (2012). Mall management – operating in India retail space. Concept of shopping Mall. 21-38.
- Thomas, P.(2018). An assessment of problem and prospect of organized retail through shopping malls. *Graduate Theses and Dissertations*.