Global Scientific JOURNALS

DETERMINANTS OF CUSTOMERS PATRONAGE PREFERENCE FOR SHOPPING MALLS OVER RETAIL STORES IN IBADAN.

TIMILEHIN SAMUEL AYODEJI   AND KAYODE MUHAMMED IBRAHIM

Postgraduate student, Department of Marketing and consumers studies, university of Ibadan

Email: *Ibrahim.kama93@gmail.com*

ABSTRACT

The study aimed at determinants of customer patronage preference of shopping mall over retail stores in Ibadan. The study objective analyse the effect of economic factors on the patronage of shopping malls over small retail stores in Ibadan and determine the effect of cognitive factors on the patronage of shopping malls over small retail stores in Ibadan. Survey method was used for data collection. Population of the study consist all shoppers of shopping malls in Ibadan with sample size of 385 respondents using Cochran (1977) formula. Multiple regression was used in the analysis. Result revealed that there is significant influence of economic factor and cognitive factor on the patronage of shopping malls over retail stores in Ibadan. The survey findings shows that consumers derive more level of satisfaction on multiple counts like wider choice of products and well-known brands, one stop shopping, new market arrivals, festive offers, huge discounts, and other benefits. In other words, the research reveals a significant relationship between shopping malls and customers patronage. Recommendation was made that shopping malls should improve and maintain their standard in ambiance related variables such as

recreation places, lighting, air condition, hall way and shopping space among others as it attract customers to patronize shopping malls over retail stores.

Key words: Shopping malls Marketing, Customer, Product, Patronage.

Background to the Study

The International Council of Shopping Complex defines a shopping mall as "a shopping centre which is usually enclosed and provides a controlled shopping environment."

Shopping malls are usually designed and constructed by architectural engineers and interior designers with the intention of creating a safe and attractive place for consumers and retailers to purchase varieties of goods. Shopping mall are built in such a way that it arouses the shopping interests of customers at the entrance. Mind-blowing aesthetics, visual merchandising techniques are used to enhance visibility of the stores. Bright and colourful lighting with vibrant colours, broad aisles and ramps are indeed attractive. Factors like 'convenience, cleanliness and security' are handled with due care in a shopping mall. Safety and assistance is assured with the availability of CCTVs, a help desk, a floor map etc. Also, necessary facilities like restrooms, ramps and wheelchair assistance have to be made for the differently-abled shoppers.

Shopping mall has witness tremendous increase in growth of the business all over the world as new shopping malls come up from time to time. According to Ambavale (2013), the significant growth of shopping mall is associated with many factors such as growing in the average class in developing countries, stable economic environments, size of retail industry and consumer preferences. Achoala (2017) noted that the change in taste and preference of consumers has been influenced as a result of changes in retailing sector, digital connectivity and demand for value and quality. A key factor driving the growth in malls is the growing necessity to segment consumers in terms of size, preferences and increment in earnings (Sadachar, 2014).

The growth of shopping malls however is not without its implications on the economy. While it has been said that the rapid growth in shopping malls increase employment opportunity

and tax paid to government. It has been said that it has adverse effect on small retail stores as many consumers now patronize shopping malls instead of retail stores. Mathews (2018) found that shopping malls have adverse effect on retail business sales volume and profitability because they use a variety of marketing strategies to attract customers which the retail sector cannot compete with. Kalhan (2017) also pointed out that the growth of shopping malls has led to decrease in employment opportunities. This is evidently so as many nearby local shops are edge out of business and job are loss in the process. Hence, this research investigated the determinants of customer patronage preference of shopping mall over retail stores in Ibadan.

Statement of the Problem

Retail stores are as old as man. It involves selling of products- good and services to customers usually the final consumers. Retail business is said to be source of survival to the considerable sections of the society in the city, as they contribute and improve income generation and employment opportunities in the urban areas (Shanmuganandavadivel,2016). Retail stores contributes to economic growth and development through the provision of jobs and creation of value. They also utilize local raw materials. However, despite its significant contribution to the economy, its existence is threatened by the growth in the number of shopping malls. Many customers had shifted loyalty and patronage from small retail business to shopping malls. This has led to significant decrease in the sales volume and profitability of the small retail sector and also loss of jobs due to closure.

The development and expansion of marketing and current development in the Nigerian economy like increase in population, customer awareness; globalization, technological advancement and deregulation have influenced business and marketing activities (Thomas 2018). Knox and Denison (2000) analyzed the significant of physical and social surrounding such as location, decor, noise, aromas, lighting, intensity and physical structure. None of these result however indicated how various physical features could serve as stimuli for customers. Satisfaction of

customers while shopping inevitably is an important issue for shopping for the second or subsequent time. The experimental area of shopping are of feelings and interest to retailers, in today's tough competitive environment, retailers are concerned about the factors that have effect on the feelings and states of their patrons and try to implement appropriate strategies aimed at making a shopping experience a pleasant one. It therefore becomes imperative to critically study the factors responsible for this shift in patronage of retail stores to shopping malls in Ibadan. It also seeks to identify the target customers and their demographic characteristics.

Research question

With the above problem statement in focus, the study seeks to find answers to the following questions;

    i. *How are the economic factors affecting the patronage of shopping malls over retail stores in Ibadan?*

    ii. *Can cognitive factors have effect on the patronage of shopping malls over small retail stores in Ibadan?*

Research Objectives

The broad objective of the study is to investigate the determinants for customers patronage preference of shopping malls over retail stores in Ibadan. The specific objectives are to;

    i. *analyse the effect of economic factors on the patronage of shopping malls over small retail stores in Ibadan.*

    ii. *determine the effect of cognitive factors on the patronage of shopping malls over small retail stores in Ibadan.*

Hypotheses

Three hypotheses are hereby formulated in null form in line with the objective. They are;

Hypothesis I;

H_0: There is no significance impact of economic factors on the patronage of shopping malls over retail stores in Ibadan.

Hypothesis II;

H_0: There is no significance effect of cognitive factors on the patronage of shopping malls over retail stores in Ibadan.

Justification of the Study

Retail stores account for large volume of small and medium scale enterprises in Ibadan. They are nucleus of economic growth. However, many challenges are facing the retail sector of which shopping malls is a significant one as many consumers now prefer to patronize the shopping mall instead of the long standing traditional retail sector. It is therefore important to carry out this study to unravel the reasons and factors responsible for the patronage of shopping malls over retail stores.

Scope of the Study

This study focus on the factors responsible for the patronage of shopping malls over retail stores in Ibadan. It also cover the history and definition of shopping mall, empirical studies relating to shopping malls and small business as well as theories relating to patronage and preference were reviewed. The scope of the study covered customers of shopping malls who have patronize retail stores in the past or still patronizing.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

Shopping Mall

According to the International Council of Shopping Complex, a shopping mall is "a shopping centre which is usually enclosed and provides a controlled shopping environment."

Shopping Malls systems symbolizes a modern life style as people go there not just to buy what they need but also to eat, drink, meet new people as well as watch the cinema.

Shopping malls are one of the configurations of the shopping centre, are typically enclosed, with climate controlled walkways and parking in the outlying areas. (Thomas, 2018). Shopping malls have an onsite staff operating the mall as a single business. The customer services, marketing, operations, and administrative positions in most shopping malls are described, focusing primarily on the supervisory tier.

Types of Malls

According to (Singh, & Srinivasan, 2012) the concept of Shopping Mall ever since its inception has undergone structural and conceptual changes. The gradual evolution has been significant enough to add distinct characteristics to each kind of mall available. Merchandise differentiation also plays a dominant role on segregating the different kinds of Shopping Malls. Following are some of the famous and commonly available kinds of malls as per International Council of Shopping Centers:-

Regional Shopping Malls According to ICSC i.e. International Council of Shopping Centers, a 'regional mall' is typically between 400,000 sq. ft. to 800,000 sq. ft. gross leasable area(GLA) with at least two anchors and offers a wider range of selection of stores. Such a shopping mall is larger than most of the conventional malls.

Super-Regional Shopping Malls Such a mall has a large number of anchor stores. It offers an in-depth option of merchandise to choose from. This is the reason that such a shopping mall is able to have a large catchment area. With over 800,000 sq. ft. of GLA, such a shopping mall acts as a prime shopping venue for the people in its catchment area.

Outlet Shopping Malls An outlet mall consists of discounted branded merchandise and is sold directly to the customers. Such malls are also a hot shopping destinations because of their pocket

friendly feature. Most of the stores in an outlet mall sell high quality and deep discounted products.

Vertical Shopping Malls: Vertical Shopping Malls are referred to the high-rise shopping malls in the cities of India. As most of the shopping malls in India are situated inside the cities rather than the suburban areas, they have no option to expand, except vertically. Paucity of space in the prime location of the cities is the main reason for the origin of such shopping malls in India. The most crucial aspect that these malls have to make sure is that they entice the customers to move vertically up, whereas the customers have a natural tendency to move around horizontally.

Luxury Shopping Malls Such a shopping mall has a clear STP (Segmentation, Targeting and Positioning) Strategy. This is a place where a shopper can find all the high end luxury brands, mostly global brands. Such a concept is trending the metropolitan cities of India, but yet to venture out in 'tier II and tier III' cities of India. For instance, DLF Emporio is house to brands like Versace, Da Milano, Louis Vitton, Rolex and Omega to name a few.

Strip Shopping Mall Such a shopping mall is the most commonly found 'shopping mall' in the small cities of India. In most of the small cities in India, usually regular shopping centers with some organized retail stores and an open area with walkways are refereed as a 'Shopping Mall'. Here the stores are usually built in one row for clear visibility and increase attractiveness.

Mall Management

Mall management involves the processes of development of a mall from the idea stage to the day to day running of a mall. Thomas (2018) identifies five (5) stages of mall management. They are;

1. **Ideation of a Shopping Mall**: This is the first stage of the mall management process. It involves an extensive market analysis with respect to the analysis of the need of the consumers,

market segmentation and targeting and positioning strategy. The objectives of the mall and the location should be addressed at this stage.

2. **Construction of a Shopping Mall:** Here, the design of the Mall is looked into. It is a crucial stage where the entire architecture design of the mall including the lay-out, store arrangement, parking-lot, customer movement and other structural arrangement are taken care of. The stage involves a perfect balance of the resources available with good architectural designing, optimum utilization of space, eco-friendly designs and world class facilities that will attract retailers and shoppers both at short and long run.

3. **Promotion/Marketing of a Shopping Mall:** This is nucleus of the success of the mall. Drucker asserts that the essence of business is its customers. At this stage, the mall embarks on making people aware of its existence. This could be through extensive advertisement like television advert and radio advert or promotion activities like distributing fliers to potential customers. Social Media should also be incorporated into the marketing ambience.

4. **Handling the Operations of a Shopping Mall:** This involves the day to day running and managing of the mall. The everyday functioning of the mall is very important and this goes beyond making goods available at the malls to ensuring adequate security of the mall, cleaning of the mall as well as good customers' relation. There should be training and continuous training of mall workers.

5. **Maintenance of a Shopping Mall:** This requires a lot of efforts as no matter how clean and good looking a mall is at the outset, if it is not properly managed, it will lose its charm overtime and customers may become disinterested.

Attributes of Shopping Mall

Attributes of shopping malls includes the characteristics and features of shopping mall. These are the intrinsic and extrinsic shopping malls offers their customers. The perceived

attributes of a mall will help it attracts customers. Hence, the attributes a mall accounts majorly for its patronage.

Shopping mall attributes includes the assortment of stores in a shopping mall, facilities both entertainment and convenience related, safety and security provision in mall, demographics such as location, ambience in a shopping mall, parking arrangement in a shopping mall, socialization aspects of a mall as well as promotional activities of a shopping mall.

(a)   Assortment of Stores in a Mall: This refers to the arrangement of stores in the shopping mall. It deals with the combination of tenants in the shopping mall. Thomas (2018) observed that there is no identified and ideal mix of tenants and there is formula that can be used to achieve the perfect synergy between retail units and service providers. It is considered that to be successful, the mix of tenants must be, at the same time, heterogenous and homogenous. Each tenant must provide a unique product or service concerning the others.

Customers are often drawn to a mall because of the variety of stores available, this made possible the availability of several products. However, the selection of stores in a shopping mall is a very complicated and laborious process. The difficulty emerges from the need to consider, in addition to competitor- other commercial centres, shopping areas and independent shops, the interactions between the stores of the same centre. Moreover, it must be noted that consumer preferences keep changing and getting relevant and accurate information about their attitudes is difficult (Thomas, 2018). Also, developers rely more on experience or intuition and therefore make errors in selecting the best location or in establishing centre's size, design and configuration, anchors and other shops or service providers or in drafting contract clauses. Increased competition from newly formed shopping centres and modernised also make the selection and combination of stores a difficult one.

Mall stores could base on the following consideration;

(i) Location: business is as successful as its location. The essence of location in a business cannot be overestimated. Selecting stores and tenants in a shopping mall equally calls for strategic positioning. The needs of those in the environment should be considered.

(ii) Brand: assortments of stores could also be based on the several brands customers are interested in but this should be done in such way that will lead to unhealthy competition among brands. Diverse brands could be mixed in the malls.

(iii) Purpose: the purpose of the mall can also determine the types of tenants it should occupy. A fashion mall could carry stores like Adidas, Nike, Balenciaga, Fila, Vendi, Gucci, Puma, HolliStar among others. A food mall should house several brands dealing in food like Honeywell, Golden Penny, Dangote, King etc. Although, malls serving specific purpose are rare to come by in Nigeria.

Thomas (2018) observed that depending on the degree of innovation of the mix of tenants, products and services, opportunities such as assimilating new types and individual units, maintaining or improving existing retail units.

(b)   Ambience in a Mall: This refers to the design and layout of the shopping mall. They are the intangible features of a mall. It includes the interior and exterior decoration of a shopping mall. Features like lightning, music, colour inside the mall, environment, scent etc are important attribute of a shopping mall. Ambience creates the whole shopping atmosphere which can enhance a shopping experience or deteriorate it.

Ezeh and Harris (2007) in Thomas (2018) observed that various factors like music played in the shopping mall, fragrance/smell, and lighting have a positive impact on the consumer buying behaviour. There are five widespread atmospheric elements that influence customer behavious. They are; ambience, colour, décor, layout and music'.

(c)   Parking Arrangement in Mall: one of the reason for the preference of shopping mall over retail business is parking space and parking arrangements. In Nigeria, parking space creates huge

problem anywhere. Car owners and drivers alike face serious problems in the hands of enforcement agencies and even fellow citizen. While law enforcement officers can arrest and/or extort money from drivers parked against their instruction, some ordinary citizen go to the extent of deflating the car tyres or even stealing spare parts of the car. Some even demand money before allowing people to park on government designated parking space on the street. This poses serious trouble to shoppers and the availability of a good parking space and parking arrangement at a mall can draw them to the mall.

(d)   Facilities in a Mall: Physical environment of the mall has an enduring effect on the emotional states of the shoppers as many viewed the shopping mall as a place not for shopping alone but also for other activities such as entertainment. Entertainment is crucial to shopping malls because it induces an existing and fun-filled shopping experience, which in turn could entice consumer patronage.

The availability of entertainment facilities such as Snookers, Table Tennis and other games at a mall draws customers to it and also ensure continuous patronage. Convenient facilities like restroom are also one of the attribute of a mall.

(e)   Safety and Security Provisions in a Shopping Mall: the challenges of insecurity facing Nigeria cannot be over stated. Hence, many elite and middle class Nigerians prefer shopping at a place where they can buy what they want in peace and go home quietly. Also, most street in many urban cities in Nigeria is filled with Almajiri kids and others begging for alms. Aside that the sight of them can pose emotional trauma to some people, some of them goes to the extent of dragging your hand or cloth. Hence, one of the attributes shopping malls have other retail outlets is safety and security.

(f)   Socialisation: Another attributes that distinguishes a mall is the provision of avenue for socialisation. Shopping malls in Nigeria is driven by the youths and couples who are constant patronizers of this ventures. Friends, colleagues, lovers and associates select shopping malls as a

place to meet, relax and rub mind. This is in line with the history of shopping malls where it was first consider as a place to socialize.

(g)   Promotional Activities: one of the key attributes of malls is promotional activities. Many brands choose malls as a place to launch their products and offer promotions like price discounts, buy two, get one for free and so on. Many malls are always offering discounts during festivities like Christmas, Easter, Ramadan Fasting, Eid-el-Kabir and some other national holidays. Some customers of malls go to the extent of offering a raffle draw where winners win different prizes. This also endears customers to them.

Empirical review

Many scholars had written on the impacts of shopping malls on retail and traditional business and a host of others had exploited the preference of one shopping mall to another.

Shanmuganandavadivel (2016) in his research explore on the impact of mega shopping malls on the small retail business sector in Coimbatore City of India. The study utilized survey method and used interview schedules to obtain data Stratified random and judgement sampling technique was used to select 180 respondents who are all retailers. The findings showed that mega shopping malls have an adverse effects on small retail business. It further recommended that small retailers should come together to form a partnership or limited liability company so as to compete with these mega shopping malls.

Jaafaru (2018) investigated the correlates of consumer patronage of shopping mall in metropolitan Lagos. Survey method, questionnaire and interview schedule was used in data collection. Simple random sampling was used to select 300 respondents. Descriptive and Inferential statistics mainly regression was used to analysed the data obtained. Result shows that

ambience of shopping malls, assortment of stores; sales promotions and comparative economic gains in the malls attract higher customer traffic to the malls.

Acholla (2017) examined consumer patronage and perception towards shopping malls in east of Nairobi County. Convenience sampling was used to select 240 customers of which 138 filled the questionnaire. The data collected was analysed using Regression analysis. The study found a statistically significant relationship between customer experience with store aspects and customer perceptions.

McGreevy (2016) in his study examined the economic and employment impacts of shopping mall developments on regional and peri-urban Australian towns. The study explored the short and long term effects of shopping malls on Australian regional towns. Workplace data were compared before and after the opening of major malls in three Australia regional towns and between nine towns that have had either shopping malls or traditional town centres for over 20 years. The study found no evidence of increases in economic activity over the short term following the opening of a major shopping mall and evidence of diminished economic activity and employment over the long term.

Thomas (2018) Krejcie & Morgan (1970) formula was used for determining sample size and selecting 400 respondents who were shopping malls customers across tier II cities of Rajasthan of which 372 completed the survey.

Makgopa (2016) in his study "Determing Consumers' Reasons for Visiting Shopping Malls" investigated the main reasons customers visit shopping malls and their frequency of visit. Non-probability quota sampling technique was used to select 108 respondents and interviewer-administered questionnaire was used to collect quantitative data from them. Data collected was analysed using descriptive statistics. The result shows that consumers visit malls for several reasons which are beyond purchase of product but also for entertainment reasons which includes

watching movies, celebrating special occasions among others. The study recommended mall managers and retailers to increase promotional activities to enhance shoppers experience.

Theoretical Review

Theory of Planned Behavior (TPB)

This theory was propounded by Ajzen in 1988. It attempted to forecast certain behaviours and decisions (Acholla, 2017). It is defined as "a complex set of attitudinal, subjective, and perceived behavioral control variables, influences behavioral intention" (Acholla, 2017). The theory posits that certain behavior is the outcome of intentions, but cognitive of perceived behavioral control (Ajzen, 2006 in Acholla, 2017).

Behavioral beliefs revealed that attitudes both acceptable and unacceptable can bring about a behavior. Normative beliefs depict that pressure from the social class or subjective norms, perceived behavioral control result from perceived restrictions and controls. Consumer attitude, influence on subjective norms and their perceptions towards a behavior to a large extent influences their consumption and purchase decisions.

The theory examines the chain of events that guide consumer patronage behavior and provide specific guidelines on the factors that possibly influence such behavior. It opined that consumers patronage behavior is controlled by attitudes and goals formed before the exact customers' behavior.

Theory of Buyer Behavior

Acholla (2017) noted that the theory of buyer behavior was developed as an advancement of the first consumer decision-model in 1969 by Howard and Sheth. It consists of variables called "input variables" which refers to the external environmental elements customers are exposed to. These factors are developed from a variety of sources including price, quality,

availability, brands, distinctive and service. Acholla (2017) observed that the symbolic ones are quality, price, distinctive, availability, service, social status and environment.

Du Plessis, & Rousseau, (1991) in Acholla (2017) noted that products and brands are the major elements consumer focused on. He referred to them as significant stimuli. Product representations and brands are the symbolic stimuli done through advertising and affects the consumer directly. Peer group, age group, family and other groups are the major source of social stimuli. These social stimuli are mostly internalize by consumers before making buying decisions.

Acholla (2017) observed that the hypothetical constructs is influenced by the available information, bias, sensitivity and the ability to have restrictions and control on perception. Exogenous variables like significance of purchase, personality variables, social class, organizational culture, economic status and time pressure can hugely impact buying decisions. The theory posit that the resulting outcome which represents consumers decision making process are knowledge of need, intention development, actual purchase, attention and attitudes.

The theory accounts for a range of variables affecting human behavior including significant stimuli, social stimuli and symbolic stimuli.

Perceived Behavioral Control

This is concerned about the individual belief of having the important resources, skills and awareness to carry out a particular behavior. Shim et al., (2001) in Partney (2010) noted that PBC has more influence on purchase intentions than attitude.

This research will adopt theory of buyer behaviour as it consists variables called "input variables" which refers to the external environmental elements customers are exposed to. These factors are developed from a variety of sources including price, quality, availability, brands, distinctive and service.

Critique of related literature and gaps in the Literature

Many scientific literature have been reviewed on this study, however, this literature reviewed on the Customers Patronage Preference for Shopping Malls over Retail Stores in Ibadan with preference to customers buying behaviour. This research filled the gap by focusing extensively on customers patronage preference. Also, previous research on Customers Patronage Preference for Shopping Malls over Retail Stores were carried out in other parts and other countries. This research filled the gap by focusing on Determinants of Customers Patronage Preference for Shopping Malls over Retail Stores in Ibadan.

Furthermore, despite a growing number of study in this research, there has been no stable results on the variables of customer patronage preference and the findings differs across countries. The diversity of findings in this area depends not only on the method adopted for this study, but also on the constructed research model and the context of the research.

METHODOLOGY

Research Design

Survey design was used because it involves the usage of self-designed questionnaire and interview schedule for data collection.

Study Area

The study focus on shopping malls in Ibadan metropolis. Ibadan is the capital city of Oyo State and largest city in Nigeria. There are sixteen (16) major shopping malls in Ibadan. However this study focus on five (5) most prominent ones which are;

- Cocoa Mall

- Heritage Mall

- Palm shopping Mall

- Jericho Mall and;

- Ventura Mall.

Population and Sample

Population of the study consist customers of shopping malls in Ibadan which number is difficult to ascertain.

A total of 385 respondents were utilized for this study.

Sample Size Determination

Purposive sampling technique was used to select and administer the study questionnaire on mall shoppers who have patronized or still patronizing small retail business.

The sample size was determined using Cochran (1977) formula.

Therefore, the sample size for this research study is **385**

Administration of Data Instrument

The major instrument used in this research was self-designed semi-structured questionnaire which allow respondents to also express their mind and enable me to get more in-depth information from them on patronage of shopping malls over retail stores in Nigeria.

The questionnaire was divided into two sections; Section A will focus on demographic information such as age, marital status, education, income, occupation etc. Section B elicit information on the factors responsible for the patronage of shopping malls over small retail shops in Ibadan. Five Likert model will be used in designing the questionnaires and respondents choose between Strongly Agree (SA), Agree (A), Undecided (U), Disagree (D) and Strongly Disagree (SD).

The researcher personally take the validated questionnaires to the selected shopping malls with research assistance in Ibadan, distribute them and make clarifications where necessary. All aspects of the questionnaire were explained to the respondents and the confidentiality of the information supplied were guaranteed.

Validity and Reliability of Instrument

Ten percentage of the questionnaire was taking to the field to test if it can provide necessary and needed data for testing and analyzing the study hypotheses. Reliability test was carried out using Cronbach's alpha coefficient to measure the internal consistency and test the integrity of the research instrument. From the analysis, the cronbach's alpha coefficient is 0.859 which is greater than the required 0.70. The result shows that there is a good level of internal consistency in the data collected.

Method of Data Analysis

Multiple linear regression analysis deal with the estimation and test of significance. The data was computed and analyzed using Statistical Package for Social Science (SPSS) version.

DATA PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS

Regression result 1: Analyse the impact of economic factors on the patronage of shopping malls over small retail stores in Ibadan.

Coefficients[a]

Model		Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.
		Beta		
1	(Constant)		11.722	0.000
	Decoration	-0.140	-2.661	0.008
	Customer Care and Relations	-0.195	-3.897	0.000
	Socialization	0.173	3.338	0.001
	parking spaces	-0.020	-0.392	0.695

a. Dependent Variable: Malls are more secured compare to retail stores

R Square: 0.084; Adjusted R Square: 0.074

Interpretation

Decoration, Customer care and relation as well as parking spaces have negative relationship with the security of the malls. This implies that Decoration, Customer care and relation as well as parking spaces have no influence on the security of the shopping malls. Socialization has a positive relationship with the security of the malls. This implies that socialization have an

influence on the security of the shopping malls Customer care and relation are statistically significant at 1%, Decoration are statistically significant at 1%, while socialization is also statistically significant at 1%.

Regression result 2: determine the effect of cognitive factors on the patronage of shopping malls over small retail stores in Ibadan.

Coefficients[a]

Model	Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.
	Beta		
(Constant)		10.768	0.000
Offerings of variety of goods	0.031	0.632	0.528
Several modes of payment	-0.167	-3.408	0.001
Prestige	-0.096	-2.025	0.044
Value addition by housing outlet that adds value to product	0.034	0.699	0.485
Exhibition shows	0.013	0.268	0.789
Promotional activities	-0.360	-7.343	0.000
Price discounts	0.098	2.057	0.040

a. Dependent Variable: Shopping malls offer quality products compared to retail stores

Interpretation

Offerings of variety of goods, Value addition by housing outlet that adds value to product, Exhibition shows and Price discounts have a positive relationship with the quality of products offered by the shopping malls. This implies that Offerings of variety of goods, Value addition by

housing outlet that adds value to product, Exhibition shows and Price discounts have an influence on the quality of products offered by the shopping malls. Several modes of payment, Prestige and Promotional activities have negative relationship with the quality of products offered by the shopping malls. This implies that several modes of payment, Prestige and Promotional activities have no influence on the quality of products offered by the shopping malls. Several modes of payment is significant at 1%, prestige is significant at 1%, promotional activities is significant at 1% and price discount is as well significant at 1%

Discussion of result

The regression model indicated that Socialization has a positive relationship with the security of the malls, Offerings of variety of goods, Value addition by housing outlet that adds value to product, Exhibition shows and Price discounts have a positive relationship with the quality of products offered by the shopping malls. The result is consistence with past research. (Jaafaru 2018) investigated the correlates of consumer patronage of shopping mall in metropolitan Lagos. He found that ambience of shopping malls, assortment of stores; sales promotions and comparative economic gains in the malls attract higher customer traffic to the malls. Also the study of Acholla (2017) examined consumer patronage and perception towards shopping malls in east of Nairobi County. The study found a statistically significant relationship between customer experience with store aspects and customer perceptions.

Customer patronage of the shopping malls tend to be influenced by the ambience of the shopping mall and convenience. This include peripheral mall ambience, inside mall ambience which consists of decoration, flowers and vegetation. Air-conditioning, public address system, recreational place, hall way and shopping space, relaxing benches and terrace attraction. The peripheral mall ambience includes car parking, security standards, and easy access to public transport from the mall.

- The findings also showed that shopping malls adapt marketing strategies to attract patronage. These are creative sales events, product demonstration, in store advertising, customer interaction, recreation and newness of products.

- Data analysis further revealed that product attribute which include quality of the product, price, availability of new product and product value act, as stimulus in influencing consumer choice of shopping malls.

- The result also established that there is a relationship between the shopping malls patronage and economic factors. It can be seen that a good portion of the sample belong to all class of the society as their average income is less than 30,000 per monthly.

SUMMARY, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Summary of findings

This study examined the Determinants of Customers Patronage Preference for Shopping Malls over Retail Stores in Ibadan. Researcher result from the survey findings shows that consumers derive more satisfaction on multiple counts like wider choice of products and well-known brands, one stop shopping, new market arrivals, festive offers, huge discounts, and other benefits. The results indicated that almost all income groups are benefiting from shopping mall purchases. Most of the consumers agreed that they benefits in terms of low pricing when they shop with malls. Two hypothesis were formulated in the research, the result shows there is positive significant of the hypothesis tested which are;

Hypothesis I;

Hi: There is significance impact of economic factors on the patronage of shopping malls over retail stores in Ibadan.

Hypothesis II;

Hi: There is significance effect of cognitive factors on the patronage of shopping malls over retail stores in Ibadan.

Conclusion

Today, there have been increase in customers patronising shopping due to several factors which has effect on patronage, survival of small retail stores. In examining the determinants of customers' patronage preference for shopping malls over retail stores in Ibadan shows that shopping at malls is highly influenced by demographic factors, cognitive and economic variables. Consumer patronage of the shopping malls in Ibadan tends to be influenced by the ambience of the shopping mall and convenience which attract increase in number of customers to the malls. The ambience include peripheral mall ambience like car parking, good security network, restroom, access to public transport from the mall. The inside mall ambience consists of showers and vegetation, air-conditioning, lighting, recreational centre, cinema, CCTV, exhibition, hall way and shopping space, relaxing benches and terrace attraction.

Shopping malls adopt several marketing strategies to attract patronage which includes creative sales events, product demonstration, in store advertising, customer interaction, recreation and newness of products.

Product attributes which include quality of the products, durability, price, availability of new product and product value act as stimulus in influencing consumer choice of shopping malls.

The development and growth of shopping malls and leisure facility center in Nigeria is grid around customer satisfaction in reference point to selection, atmosphere, convenience, attractions, sales people; refreshments policy (Anselmsson, 2006). The development and growth in marketing and the current growth in the Nigerian economy like increase in population, customer awareness, infrastructure development, globalization, technological advancement and deregulation have improve business and marketing activities in Nigeria. The study seeks to

examine study examined the determinants of customers patronage preference for Shopping Malls over Retail Stores in Ibadan

The study reveals that shopping arousal is largely driven by mall attractions, interpersonal influence, sales promotion and competitive gains among customers in reference to recreational facilities in place, location, reference to products and services, brand value and price.

Promotional attractions have a positive advantage on customer patronage of shopping malls. Promotional attractions include: display of product, in-store ambience, availability, length of promotion and value added advantages.

The study examined that there is a relationship between the shopping malls sales growth and lower, middle and upper class patronage. It can be argued that a good portion of the sample belongs to the middle class and upper class of the society as their average income is more than N30, 000 monthly. Also from the survey result, it can be observed that those who have higher income prefer to patronize shopping malls over retail stores.

Recommendations

Based on findings of the study, the following recommendations are proffered;

- Promotional effects generated from various promotional tools should be monitored for longer periods of time and measured in reference to achieving the long-term goals of the shopping malls. Variability of promotional response in different retail channels and outlets should be analyzed for making required modification in line of delivery of promotional programs to the customers.

- Shopping malls should improve and maintain their standard in ambiance related variables such as recreation places, lighting, air condition, hall way and shopping space among others as it attract customers to patronize shopping malls over retail stores.

- Shopping mall management to increase social and recreational facilities in the malls.

- The government should ensure free flow of traffic around malls so that even non users of the malls are not inconvenient. Hence, Government should monitor the sitting of malls in the city.

References

Acholla, C. (2017). Consumer patronage and perception towards shopping malls in east of Nairobi County. *Journal of international marketing, 7*(5).

Ajzen, I. (1988). The theory of planned behaviour. *Organizational Behaviour, and Human Decision Processes*, *50*(2), 179-211.

Ajzen, I. (2006). Constructing a theory of planned behaviour questionnaire: Conceptual and methodological consideration.

Ambavale, S.(2013). Consumers" attitude towards online shopping: Factors influencing employees of crazy domain to shop online. *Journal of Management and Market Research*, *14*, 1-11.

Du Plessis, P., & Rousseau, G. & Blem N.H. (1991). Consumer behaviour. A south African perspective. Pretoria. Sigma.

Ezeh D.P., & Harris L.,(2007) services cape research: A review and a research agenda. *Marketing review*, *7*(1), 59-78.

Jaafaru, B. U.(2018). Correlates of consumer patronage of shopping mall in metropolitan Lagos. *Texila International Journal of Management*, *4*(2), 1-21. DOI:10.21522/TIJMG.2015.04.02.Art008

Kalhan, A. (2017). Impact of malls on small shops and hawkers. *Economic and Political weekly*, *6*, 2063-2066.

Knox S., & Denison T. (2000). Its impact on retail revenue. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer services, 7*(1), 33-45. Doi: doi.org/10.1016/S0969-6989(98)00033-2

Krejcie, D., & Morgan W. (1970) Viability of Exploratory Factor Analysis as a Precursor to Confirmatory Factor Analysis. *Structural Equation Modeling*, *3*(1), 62-72.

Makgopa, S. (2016). Determining consumers' reasons for visiting shopping malls. *Innovative Marketing, 12*(2), 22-27. doi:10.21511/im.12(2).2016.03

Mathews, V. (2018). Impact of shopping malls on small retail outlets-A study in Kollam city, Kerala. *International Journal of Research and Analytical Reviews*, *5*(3), 1408-1417. http://ijrar.com/

McGreevy, B. (2016). The economic and employment impacts of shopping mall developments on regional and peri-urban Australian towns. *The service Industries Journal, 22*(1), 122-146.

Patney, M. B.(2010) "Indian consumers and their mall patronage: Application of cultural-self and the theory of planned behavior to patronage intentions". *Graduate Theses and Dissertations*. 11749. https://lib.dr.iastate.edu/etd/11749

Sadachar, A. (2014). *Indian consumers' patronage intention towards shopping malls: Application of an experience economy perspective.*

Shanmuganandavadivel, J. (2016). A study on the impact of mega shopping malls on small retail business sector. *International Journal of Advanced Research (IJAR)*, *4*(8), 1569-1573. DOI:10.21474/IJAR01/1363

Shim, S., Eastlick, M. A., Lotz, S. L., & Warrington, P. (2001). An online prepurchase intentions model: The role of intention to search. *Journal of Retailing, 77,* 397–416.

Singh, H., & Srinivason, S. (2012). Mall management – operating in India retail space. Concept of shopping Mall. 21-38.

Thomas, P.(2018). An assessment of problem and prospect of organized retail through shopping malls. *Graduate Theses and Dissertations*.